



CITY OF LAKE WORTH
1900 2nd Ave N · Lake Worth, Florida 33461 · Phone: 561-586-1687

Agenda
Regular Meeting
City of Lake Worth
Historic Resources Preservation Board
City Hall Commission Room
7 North Dixie Hwy; Lake Worth, FL

WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 10, 2016 6:00 PM

1. Roll Call and Recording of Absences
The meeting was called to order by the Chairman.
Present: Herman Robinson, Jimmy Zoellner, Tom Norris, Judith Just, Darrin Engel
Also present were: Aimee Sunny Planning Preservation Coordinator; Maxime Ducoste Planning & Preservation Manager; Carolyn Ansay, Board Attorney; Sherie Coale Board Secretary.
2. **Pledge of Allegiance**
Led by Chairman Robinson. Also noted the contributions of Board member Loretta Sharpe. Known for her zest for all things Lake Worth.
3. Additions/Deletions/Reordering and Approval of the Agenda
Motion to approve the agenda: J.Zoellner, 2nd J. Just.
Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.
4. Approval of Minutes
Postpone approval of minutes until next meeting.
 - A. October 2015 Meeting Minutes
 - B. November 2015 Meeting Minutes
 - C. January 2016 Meeting Minutes
5. Cases
 - A. Swearing in of Staff and Applicants
Staff and applicants were sworn in by Board Secretary.
 - B. Proof of Publication
 1. Lake Worth Herald
Motion to accept the proofs of publication: J. Zoellner and 2nd J. Juste
Vote: Ayes all, unanimous
 - C. Withdrawals/Postponements: None
 - D. Consent: None

E. Public Hearings

1. Board Disclosure: None

- a. HRPB Project Number 15-00100209: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for new construction of a rear accessory garage, for the single-family structure located at 525 North Palmway; PCN# 38-43-44-21-15-162-0110. The subject property was constructed in 1939 and is a contributing resource within the Old Lucerne Local Historic District.

Staff comments: A. Sunny gives brief background of request and findings.

Applicant comments: Larry Rowe, contractor, is agreeable to conditions of approval. Clarifies recessing the garage door.

Motion: D. Engel to approve subject to staff conditions. J. Zoellner 2nd

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

- b. HRPB Project Number 15-00100230: Consideration of Pre-Construction Approval for a Historic Preservation Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for the property located at 514 South J Street, PCN# 38-43-44-21-15-171-0100. The subject building was constructed c.1924 and the property is a contributing resource within the Southeast Lucerne Local Historic District.

Staff Comments: A. Sunny reminds the Board site changes were previously approved and this is only for the tax abatement.

Applicant comment: None

Public comment: None

Motion to approve by D. Engel J. Just 2nd.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

F. Unfinished Business

1. HRPB Project Number 15-00100211: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for roof replacement to the subject property located at 731 N M St, PCN# 38-43-44-21-15-220-0090. The subject building was constructed in 1946 and the property is a contributing resource within the Northeast Lucerne Local Historic District.

Staff Comment: To date the applicant has not provided any additional information or insight into the choice of the roofing material. Staff recommends denial because standing seam does not meet standards.

Board Comment: J. Zoellner, H. Robinson, D. Engel, J. Just all voice preference for the standing seam vs the shingled roof.

Applicant comment: John Downing believes the structure is not contributing, when the survey was done, no one contacted him. He cites 4 other masonry vernacular homes with metal roofs in his immediate area.

J. Zoellner states the standing seam looks nice as opposed to the asphalt single roof and aids in its architectural character.

D. Engel and J. Just believe if this home were surveyed today, it would not be a contributing structure due to so many changes in the past.

Public comment: Marion Cone- State would recommend not white and not tin. Board and applicant do not get to choose which previous iteration the applicant is able to do. Be careful of setting a precedent.

William Waters: anecdotal information as to the roofing styles of the past in South Florida and historical accurateness. We should be careful to not distort masonry vernacular.

T. Norris is against approval due to the vertical lines of the roof.

Motion: J. Just motions to approve the request J, Zoellner 2nd.

Nays: T. Norris

Ayes: D. Engel, J. Just, H. Robinson, J. Zoellner

Motion passes 4/1.

G. New Business

1. HRPB Project Number 15-00100231: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for roof replacement to the subject property located at 520 North Palmway, PCN# 38-43-44-21-15-164-0050. The subject building was constructed in 1939 and the property is a contributing resource within the Old Lucerne Local Historic District. Staff recommends denial of standing seam for frame vernacular. A. Sunny reads from State Historical guidelines which offers a solution of metal shingles to be certified for South Florida Building Code by an engineer with the cost to be borne by applicant. Board: There is a consensus that metal shingles do look good. Etching and recoated. Applicant Comment: Dana McLaughlin: (roofer) indicated that it is too damaged to repair. Rust and structural damage indicated. Not wood, but aluminum siding. Significant cost to get metal tile vs. standing seam roof. D. Engel: Believes an expert repair would deal with the rust thus allowing the repair. Points out Hypoluxo City Hall. H. Robinson: indicates there are options for repair and at quite a savings. D. Engel: conflicting vertical vs. horizontal lines would be the result. Recommend recoat and repair or replace metal shingles. Applicant is trying to be proactive prior to leaking and believes it is an eyesore. J. Zoellner states that this house is a prime example of a beautiful Lake Worth historical property. Roofer: Greg Brodbeck Roofing – how to repair rusting shingle that has lived its life. Says Board is proposing to spend applicant money. There are only “5” homes left with this type of roof. That Board is trying to hang on to something that is already in remission. Dana asks if an asphalt shingle would have been approved. A. Sunny indicates no, only metal shingle. Indicates home inspection would never pass in this state. Applicant states metal shingles are cost prohibitive but is willing to repair the existing if that is the solution. She has budgeted for a new roof but not double the cost. A. Sunny would recommend a product but not a particular roofer. Applicant is willing to come back in one month. William horizontal applied metal roof. Possibly a compromise will be presented at next meeting. Motion: J. Zoellner motions to continue until March meeting. 2nd T. Norris
Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.
2. HRPB Project Number 16-00100002: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for roof replacement to the subject property located at 612 North Palmway, PCN# 38-43-44-21-15-166-0030. The subject building was constructed in 1939 and the property is a contributing resource within the Old Lucerne Local Historic District.

Staff recommends denial, also a frame vernacular home.

Applicant comments: Michael Torres currently experiencing leaks.

Board comment: asks about roof quotes. Staff indicates this is not a hardship request. J. Zoellner indicates both of the last two requests are roofs that have lasted for 75 years which is remarkable. That the expense may be worth it if it lasts for that period of time.

American Roofing: Frankie provides a lesson in roofing. He wants a solution as the roof will not last for a month. Clips are different and will give problems.

Staff provides estimates in the 7-9K range, not double the amount of a standing seam roof. Barrage could be up to 20-30 % more than standing seam.

J. Zoellner indicates the applicant does have the opportunity for financial hardship. A. Sunny states some of the requirements for the application. It is understood that applicant is in need of roof. Metal shingle can be approved at staff level. Financial hardship criteria evaluation would come back before the Board. Roofer indicates he would like to remove and prepare and dry roof the applicant pending a decision to type of roof. Asphalt shingle. Board uncomfortable with having a roof torn off and not providing a resolution.

Opt to come back with a hardship application.

C. Ansay clarifies that a request for a standing seam cannot return to Board for one year.

Public comment: Jeanine Tompkins asks about asphalt dimensional shingle for hardship would be the only other state recommendation.

Motion: J. Zoellner to deny standing seam. 2nd by T. Norris

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

3. HRPB Project Number 15-00100240: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for roof replacement to the subject property located at 726 North M Street, PCN# 38-43-44-21-15-222-0060. The subject building was constructed in 1941 and the property is a contributing resource within the Northeast Lucerne Local Historic District.

Staff recommends denial. Should be metal interlocking shingle. Original asbestos shingle. Currently tarped.

D. Engel believes asphalt shingles would be acceptable.

A. Sunny provides the scale texture and coloration most closely would be a metal shingle. Roofing currently has a horizontal look. Frame vernacular style.

Applicant not present, roofer Rafael is. Unknown whether roof was originally white.

Asbestos abatement may occur depending on what is there. 3 different materials on roof, ridge cap is concrete tile.

Motion: J. Zoellner to approve with a white coloration shingle 2nd D. Engel.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

4. HRPB Project Number 15-00100234: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for window replacement for the single-family residence located at 921 South Palmway; PCN# 38-43-44-27-01-031-0131. The subject property was constructed in 1965 and is a non-contributing resource within the South Palm Park Local Historic District.

Staff recommends denial due to roller style divided light window. Awning style windows should be preserved. Roller presents vertical strength vs horizontal of the awning windows. Silver casement windows are recommended.

Board:

Applicant: Alphonse Campanelli, StormTek windows. Security and economic reasons as well as hurricane protection. Agreed to place muntions for horizontal feel. Windows are already manufactured. Anodized are not an option with this manufacturer.

Aimee says it is an excellent example of Ranch style. When a new survey comes up this house will become contributing (Built in 1965). Casement windows are the better representation, otherwise the look is window screen window screen. Alphonse indicates PGT roller does not have the larger lower bar.

J. Zoellner questions why the windows were manufactured prior to approval.

T. Norris would like to see the PGT windows prior to deciding. D. Engel indicates they are not to consider the fact that they are already manufactured.

Motion: J. Zoellner recommends denial, T. Norris 2nd.

Public comment: none

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous

5. Conceptual Review for 314 Columbia Drive: Discussion of an addition to the rear and side of the existing structure.

Applicant has requested feedback prior to moving forward with design. Board and staff indicates willingness to work with client.

6. PZB/HRPB Project Number 16-02900001 Chapter 23, Land Development Regulations & Permitted Use Table of the Lake Worth Code of Ordinances

M. Ducoste: repeat PZB. Consistency with noticing, site plan review, permitted uses by right or conditional. Mixed-Use Dixie highway promotes multi-family retail and commercial leading to impression that single family would be allowed (which is now eliminated) terminology change to lumens vs foot candle. Standard language brought up to 21st century terms (i.e. typewriter) off-street parking, signs (discrepancy permanent vs temporary set up re-alignment) landscape buffering for commercial property.

There were two changes to this document after the Planning & Zoning Board meeting.

1. The word "building" amended to structure. 2. Home occupation with regard to single family or multi-family differentiation. Motion is to recommend to City Commission. Drive through financial institutions Conditional Use only Currently there are no drive through restaurants in downtown.

T. Norris glad that Home occupation has been updated to include townhomes and condominium. Various specific lines are discussed.

C. Ansay indicates PBC can place restrictions based upon size restrictions.

T. Norris mentions LED lighting on Dixie Hwy. M. Ducoste indicates the intent is to "not draw attention" specifically to the structure, it should be complementary lighting.

Motion: D. Engel recommends approval 2nd J. Just.

Ayes all: unanimous

6. Planning Issues: None

7. Public Comments (3 minute limit): None

8. Departmental Reports:

February 10, 2016 Regular Meeting

A. Sunny relays information regarding two upcoming events Board and public may be interested in attending. Shows two (2) instances of roller window and garage doors. Economic hardship criteria needs to be reviewed. Need to analyze and access the numbers. It becomes completely subjective. The guidelines do not indicate the line is at any particular point, it varies by individual responsibility, standard of living etc..

9. Board Member Comments

Discusses the packet supply.

J. Zoellner: Hummingbird update? None

T. Norris: Questions why Burger King signage has been lowered, this a major or minor site plan modification.

M. Ducoste perhaps it was non-conforming. Comments regarding the green glow from Publix.

H. Robinson: Asks about a new appointee to replace L. Sharpe; economic hardship and economic impact on the city, historic district impact on local economies. Demo on South L will occur. Demo permit awaiting approval. Expresses concern over comments from public. The perception may be that the decisions are subjective however C. Ansay indicated what happens here is objective. Case by case does not mean subjective. Each case is reviewed, discussed and decided on its own merits.

J. Just: Was not aware of the meeting for the 17th.

D. Engel: College Park historic designation. Can this be updated by next meeting. 10th & Dixie is this a gas station (restart)?

10. Adjournment:

Motion: H. Robinson, J. Just 2nd at 9:50 pm

Vote: Ayes all: unanimous

Attest:


Herman Robinson, Chairman

Submitted By:


Sherie Coale, Board Secretary

Minutes Approved:


Date