



City Of Lake Worth
Department for Community Sustainability
Planning, Zoning and Historic Preservation Division
1900 Second Avenue North · Lake Worth, Florida 33461 · Phone: 561-586-1687

MEMORANDUM DATE: March 2, 2016

AGENDA DATE: March 9, 2016

TO: Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

RE: **1 Lake Avenue**

FROM: William Waters, Director, Department for Community Sustainability
Maxime Ducoste, Planning and Preservation Manager
Aimee Sunny, Preservation Planning Coordinator

TITLE: HRPB 15-00100216 and HRPB 15-00100217: Consideration of Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) for exterior alterations and a rear addition for the historic Gulfstream Hotel, located at **1 Lake Avenue**; PCN# 38-43-44-21-15-033-0090. The subject building was constructed in 1923 and is a contributing resource within the South Palm Park Local Historic District, as well as individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

<u>AGENT:</u> Bonnie Miskel, Esq. Dunay, Miskel and Backman, LLP 14 SE 4 th St, Suite 36 Boca Raton, FL 33432	<u>OWNER:</u> H.H. Gulfstream Land Holdings, LLC 310 SE 1 st Street Delray Beach, FL 33463
--	--

REQUEST:

The Applicant has requested a COA for exterior alterations and a rear addition for the existing (7) story hotel. The scope of work, as defined by the Applicant, is as follows:

North (Front) Façade

The front facade will be retained in its current configuration. The entire façade will be repaired where necessary. Stucco repairs will match the color and texture of the existing historic stucco. Cleaning of the exterior stucco will be accomplished using the gentlest means possible without damaging the surface of the stucco. Cleaning and repair will be done according to the guidance provided by Preservation Brief #22, The Preservation and Repair of Historic Stucco. Good quality overall and close-up color photographs of the stucco both before and after cleaning and repair will be submitted to the U.S. National Parks Service with the Request for Certification of Completed Work to ensure conformance with the Standards. The entire facade will be repainted once repaired and cleaned.

A single window will be removed on the far eastern side of the facade on the second floor to create a doorway to access the rooftop of the front porch. This rooftop will be a seating area, similar to, but smaller than, the central outdoor seating area in the center of the building. The proposed door will be of a style complementing the original architecture of the building. The far eastern bay of the front porch along Lake Avenue will be opened to accommodate an ADA platform lift system. The existing clay tile parapet caps will be repaired where necessary, using appropriate materials to match the color, scale, and profile of the existing historic clay tiles.

East (Side) Façade

The east facade will be largely retained in its current configuration. The entire facade will be repaired where necessary. Stucco repairs will match the color and texture of the existing historic stucco. Cleaning of the exterior stucco will be accomplished using the gentlest means possible without damaging the surface of the stucco. Cleaning and repair will be done according to the guidance provided by Preservation Brief #22, The Preservation and Repair of Historic Stucco. Good quality overall and close-up color photographs of the stucco both before and after cleaning and repair will be submitted to the U.S. National Parks Service with the Request for Certification of Completed Work to ensure conformance with the Standards. The entire east facades will be repainted once repaired and cleaned.

Along the second floor, where guest rooms will be located, all double window sets will be converted to a pair of French doors that access the existing rooftop, which will be used for outdoor patio space. This alteration will be out of sight to an average person on the street. Current sight lines prevent a pedestrian on the street from seeing the sills of the second floor windows because of setbacks created by the first floor colonnade.

The rear addition will have a single story east facade, which attaches at the rear of the building. The proposed addition will have a colonnaded facade, matching the rhythm of the historic colonnade. The height of the arched openings will be reduced to ensure their subservience to the original architecture and the openings will sit directly at street level, rather than being raised to interior first floor level. The facade will be stuccoed and painted to match the color of the rest of the hotel.

South (Rear) Façade

The rear facade will be largely retained. The evenly spaced windows along the second floor recess will be removed and replaced with sets of double doors, which will lead to a pool and patio area elevated to the second floor level. This pool level will attach to the original building at the second floor level and will attach to the new hotel building on the western adjoining property at the same level, creating a shared exterior space to the rear of the historic hotel.

The entire facade will be repaired where necessary. Stucco repairs will match the color and texture of the existing historic stucco. Cleaning of the exterior stucco will be accomplished using the gentlest means possible without damaging the surface of the stucco. Cleaning and repair will be done according to the guidance provided by Preservation Brief #22, The Preservation and Repair of Historic Stucco. Good quality overall and close-up color photographs of the stucco both before and after cleaning and repair will be submitted to the U.S. National Parks Service with the Request for Certification of Completed Work to ensure conformance with the Standards. The entire south facades will be repainted once repaired and cleaned.

West (Side) Façade

The west facade will retain its current configuration except for a sky-bridge attachment at the second most southern bay. The existing double set of windows will be removed and replaced with a set of double doors, which will allow hotel guests to check in through the original hotel lobby, before proceeding to their guest rooms in the newly constructed hotel building on the adjoining property.

Stucco repairs will match the color and texture of the existing historic stucco. Cleaning of the exterior stucco will be accomplished using the gentlest means possible without damaging the surface of the stucco. Cleaning and repair will be done according to the guidance provided by Preservation Brief #22, The Preservation and Repair of Historic Stucco. Good quality overall and close-up color photographs of the stucco both before and after cleaning and repair will be submitted with the Request for Certification of Completed Work to ensure conformance with the Standards.

ANALYSIS:

The Applicant has responded to the decision making criteria for granting Certificates of Appropriateness for exterior alterations and an addition. Their response has been included as Attachment 1.

Staff had previously raised concerns over several proposed alterations. The Applicant has submitted revision drawings that address most of Staff's concerns. Staff's response to each of the previous comments is as follows:

North (front) façade

- The proposed location of the accessible lift as shown is not acceptable. Staff recommends that the accessible lift be placed in the middle bay of the central entrance.
Revision Response: The location of the lift has not been revised; however the design has been adjusted to fill the entire arched bay opening. The Applicant has expressed strong objections to altering the central staircase in order to install a lift, and feels that this alteration would substantially alter the 3-bay approach to the main hotel lobby. Staff would recommend that the Applicant continue to revise the lift design in order to respect the symmetry of the north elevation. The Applicant could consider a design that incorporates a knee wall and balustrade, in order to respect the symmetrical 5-bay central portion of the north elevation.
- The proposed glass railing on the second floor will significantly alter the appearance of the historic hotel. Staff recommends that an alternate solution be proposed, which could include a decorative wrought iron railing, to be attached behind the parapet wall, or on top of the parapet wall if needed.
Revision Response: The revision drawings appear to have removed the glass railing, and have proposed a simple metal handrail instead. No detail drawing has been provided, however Staff feels that this design direction is more in keeping with the architectural character of the historic structure.
- All existing wood windows and doors on the first floor shall be repaired rather than replaced. The architectural drawings indicate the intent to repair the wood windows and doors.
Revision Response: The revision drawings indicate that the wood windows and doors will be repaired and restored.
- The detail of the proposed railing located above the central 5 bays of the elevation is not provided.
Revision Response: The revision drawings do not provide a detail, however the drawing notes do indicate that the existing railing will be removed and replaced with a period correct railing.

- The windows proposed to be changed to single French doors on the second floor shall have 15 divided lights, and shall be installed in the existing opening location.
Revision Response: The revision drawings reflect this configuration.

East (Side) façade

- The stepped parapet and decorative medallion in the central bay shall remain unchanged. The architectural drawings do not show this important character defining feature.
Revision Response: The revision drawings reflect the existing configuration and the parapet and medallion will remain unchanged.
- On the second floor, all paired windows shall be changed to double French doors with 15 divided lights, and shall be installed in the existing opening location.
Revision Response: The revision drawings reflect this configuration.
- Intermediary walls in the guest rooms must line up with a window mullion, a door mullion, or a wall. These walls shall not be located in the middle of windows, which would adversely affect the exterior appearance of the historic structure.
Revision Response: The revision drawings do not address this concern. The interior configuration will need to be altered so that the intermediary walls do not line up with a window or door as this would adversely affect the exterior appearance of the historic structure.
- The spacing of the four arched bay shall be symmetrical as viewed from the exterior. Staff recommends that a pent style roof with barrel tile be added over the four arches with a stepped parapet on each end.
Revision Response: The revision drawings reflect Staff’s recommendations to use symmetrical spacing for the arches and add a pent roof. These revisions positively enhance the design, detailing, and compatibility of the addition.
- The dumpster arch shall have a pair of rectilinear doors equal to the height of the spring point of the arch, or a pair of doors filling the entire arch.
Revision Response: The revision drawings provide a new dumpster enclosure design that fills the entire arch. The new design is well executed in the Mission Revival style and it enhances the overall design of the hotel addition.

South (Rear) façade

- The clerestory windows on the mezzanine should not be removed as proposed, but should remain in place and be backlit, so as not to change the historic appearance within the hotel lobby.
Revision Response: The revision drawings do not address this concern; however the Applicant has expressed an intent to preserve the clerestory windows if possible.

- The new French doors leading to the pool deck should not have transoms and should be installed within the existing opening location. The header height should be consistent with the windows on this floor.

Revision Response: The revision drawings reflect this configuration.

- The central bays of the south façade of the pool deck addition shall have a 3-arch reveal that could accommodate a decorative mosaic, a dog bar, and/or a fountain feature. Above this central feature, a pent roof could be installed with barrel tile similar to the one proposed on the East façade. This central bay should line up with the central bay of the existing Gulfstream hotel. The three bays flanking this central feature shall each have three arches that are appropriate for a mural.

Revision Response: The revision drawings include a more balanced arched design and a central raised parapet on the addition. The elevation could be further refined to provide enhanced decorative features including murals, mosaics, fountains, or a dog bar.

West (Side) façade

- The wood windows on the mezzanine level shall be repaired and shall remain in their existing locations.

Revision Response: The revision drawings reflect that the wood windows will be repaired and restored.

- The sky-bridge feature to the new annex should have a stepped parapet roof or a sloped barrel tile roof. Both elevations of the bridge should have 3 pairs of French doors or fixed windows in order to create a lightness and transparency between the buildings. The bridge should have appropriately styled brackets to support the span.

Revision Response: The sky-bridge has been revised and the design is compatible with the Art Deco inspired hotel annex. Further study and consideration could be given to adding decorative details and brackets to support the structure.

Entire Structure

- All balustrades shall be repaired if possible. If replacement is necessary, the replacement balusters shall match the existing in size, shape, profile, and location.

Revision Response: The drawings indicate that the balustrades and planters will be repaired.

- All existing parapet crenellation and decorative medallions shall remain and be repaired as needed. Should the applicant propose to replace decorative elements in the existing panels, this shall be reviewed by the HRPB.

Revision Response: The drawings indicate that the parapets and medallions will remain.

- All existing window and door openings should be respected in size, location, and configuration.
- Revision Response: The drawings indicate that all windows and doors will be replaced in their existing openings, unless noted otherwise, and that the divided light configuration will reflect the existing.**

- All exterior stucco should be of a consistent texture and finish that replicates the existing.

Revision Response: The revision drawings indicate this intent.

- If the decorative barrel tile pent roofs and penthouse needs to be replaced, the new tile shall match the existing.

Revision Response: The revision drawings indicate this intent.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN CONSISTENCY:

Staff has reviewed the applicable sections of the City’s Comprehensive Plan goals and objectives that would apply to this project. They are as follows:

Goal 1.3 To preserve and enhance the City’s community character as a quality residential and business center within the Palm Beach County urban area. (Objective 1.3.4)

Goal 1.6 To discourage urban sprawl. (Objective 1.6.1)

Goal 1.4 Encourage preservation and rehabilitation of historic and natural resources and where appropriate restrict development that would damage or destroy these resources. (Objective 1.4.2)

Policy 3.2.5.1: Properties of special value for historic, architectural, cultural or aesthetic reasons will be restored and preserved through the enforcement of the City’s Historic Preservation Ordinance to the extent feasible.

CONSEQUENT ACTION:

Approve the application; approve the application with conditions; continue the hearing to a date certain to request additional information; or deny the application.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Board discuss the analysis and issues outlined in this report and the revision drawings submitted. Should the Board choose to approve the request, Staff recommends the following conditions of approval:

- 1) All decorative railings, parapets, pent roofs, medallions, and other decorative details shall be designed to be compatible with the Mission Revival style of architecture, and shall be subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 2) The specific design and configuration of the accessible lift shall be subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 3) All existing wood windows and doors shall be repaired and restored.
- 4) All new windows and doors shall use exterior raised applied “putty” or “ogee” style muntins. No flat or internal muntins shall be permitted. No reflective mirrored glass shall be permitted.
- 5) All intermediary walls in the guest rooms shall line up with a window mullion, a door mullion, or a wall. These walls shall not be located in the middle of windows, as this would adversely affect the exterior appearance of the historic structure. The reconfiguration shall be subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 6) The clerestory windows in the existing hotel lobby shall remain and be incorporated into the lobby design, subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.

- 7) The south elevation could be further refined to provide enhanced decorative features including murals, mosaics, fountains, or a dog bar, subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 8) The skybridge structure could receive additional decorative details and brackets to support the structure, subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 9) All balustrades, planter boxes, decorative medallions, parapets, window and door trim, and other decorative elements shall be preserved and restored.
- 10) The Applicant shall finance and install an official State Historic Marker for the historic Gulfstream Hotel. Staff will coordinate with the Applicant regarding the text for the sign and the State Historic Marker review program, as well as determine the most appropriate location for the sign installation within the site plan.

POTENTIAL MOTION:

I MOVE TO APPROVE/DENY HRPB PR# 15-00100216: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for an addition to the historic Gulfstream Hotel, with the conditions recommended by Staff.

I MOVE TO APPROVE/DENY HRPB PR# 15-00100217: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for exterior alterations to the historic Gulfstream Hotel, with the conditions recommended by Staff.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. See Justification Statement for Decision Criteria – Addition and Alteration
2. Application Photographs
3. Revision Submittal Drawings dated 2/26/2016
4. Window and Door Information

Location Map

