



**City Of Lake Worth**  
**Department for Community Sustainability**  
**Planning, Zoning and Historic Preservation Division**  
1900 Second Avenue North · Lake Worth, Florida 33461 · Phone: 561-586-1687

**MEMORANDUM DATE:** March 2, 2016

**AGENDA DATE:** March 9, 2016

**TO:** Chair and Members of the Historic Resources Preservation Board

**RE:** **1 Lake Avenue**

**FROM:** William Waters, Director, Department for Community Sustainability  
Maxime Ducoste, Planning and Preservation Manager  
Aimee Sunny, Preservation Planning Coordinator

**TITLE:** HRPB 15-00100215: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for new construction of an annex hotel structure and parking garage associated with the historic Gulfstream Hotel, generally located at 11 Lake Avenue, and 12, 14, 20, 22 and 24 South Lakeside Drive. Parcel Control Numbers (PCNs): 38-43-44-21-15-033-0010; 38-43-44-21-15-033-0030; 38-43-44-21-15-033-0040; 38-43-44-21-15-033-0050; 38-43-44-21-15-033-0060, 38-43-44-21-15-033-0070. The subject properties are located within the South Palm Park Local Historic District.

<b>AGENT:</b> Bonnie Miskel, Esq. Dunay, Miskel and Backman, LLP 14 SE 4 <sup>th</sup> St, Suite 36 Boca Raton, FL 33432	<b>OWNER:</b> H.H. Gulfstream Land Holdings, LLC 310 SE 1 <sup>st</sup> Street Delray Beach, FL 33463
---	---

**REQUEST:**

The Applicant has requested a COA for new construction of a (5) story hotel annex building and (3) story parking structure with rooftop parking, per the plans and documentation provided.

**ANALYSIS:**

The Applicant has responded to the decision making criteria for granting Certificates of Appropriateness for new construction. Their response has been included as Attachment 1.

Staff had previously raised concerns over several proposed new construction. The Applicant has submitted revision drawings that address many of Staff's concerns. Staff's response to each of the previous comments is as follows:

**Five-story Hotel Annex Building**

- The Applicant responded to Staff's suggestions recognizing that an Art Deco influenced building would be appropriate for the location. The building design requires further refinement and changes in order to reflect this style appropriately.

**Revision Response:** The previous submittal reflected a combination of several architectural styles including Art Deco, Mediterranean, and Mission. The revision drawings propose a design that is more in keeping with the characteristics and features of Art Deco architecture.

**The revised design includes stronger vertical elements, 1/1 single-hung windows, Art Deco inspired decorative details, flat arches, and a stepped parapet, which all help to further define the architectural style.**

- All segmental arches should be removed and replaced with flat arches or openings.  
**Revision Response: The revision drawings have incorporated this design.**
- The transoms above the doors and windows on the first floor should have spandrel panels, decorative panels, bas relief, or metal screens.  
**Revision Response: The transoms previously proposed have largely been eliminated, and the space above the windows and doors have been incorporated as part of a vertical design feature that includes spandrel panels. The detailing of these decorative panels is preliminary, and Staff recommends further refinement to capture the richness of the Art Deco style.**
- Vertical elements on all facades, specifically the vertical elements flanking the entrances, should be strengthened through provision of an architectural texture or features which may include applied brick, cast stone, mosaic tiles, polychrome elements, or murals.  
**Revision Response: The vertical design features have been accentuated with stepped mouldings. The entrance on Lake Avenue has been adjusted, however additional decorative elements could be used to further enhance this principal building entrance. Staff recommends further refinement to capture the richness of the Art Deco style.**
- Windows on all facades shall be 1/1 or 3/1 configuration.  
**Revision Response: The windows have been adjusted to a 1/1 configuration. The windows are extremely large, almost equal with the proposed French doors. This size may need to be altered due to building code restrictions or to enhance the hierarchy of internal spaces. Staff supports the general configuration of the windows, and could work with the Applicant if revisions to the size and location are needed in the future.**
- Decorative balconies require a supporting bracket appropriate for the style.  
**Revision Response: The balcony bracket detail has not been revised. Staff recommends a stepped design, of which a precedent can be found on many historic Art Deco structures.**
- Upper floor windows should have a thick header.  
**Revision Response: This comment has been successfully incorporated into the vertical design feature that includes each vertical columns of windows.**
- Bulk of the building is 47 feet from Lake Avenue, which is inconsistent with the City’s Land Development Regulations (LDRs), Historic Guidelines, and Major Thoroughfare Guidelines.  
**Revision Response: This comment has not been addressed. The bulk of the building is still set back 47 feet from the Lake Avenue property line. The Applicant has proposed to move the one-story portico closer to Lake Avenue, with a proposed setback of 17 feet.**

- Lake Avenue elevation should have a 3-bay or 5-bay massing configuration with two or more of the bays pulled toward Lake Avenue to meet the intent of the LDRs and Guidelines. The massing of the building should be closer to Lake Avenue in deference to the historic location of buildings along this major thoroughfare.  
**Revision Response: The revision drawings do not reflect this recommendation with regards to the main massing of the building, however the one-story portico has been moved so that it is 17 feet from the property line on Lake Avenue.**
- Lake Avenue should be provided with a principal entrance, designed as such.  
**Revision Response: A principal entrance has been proposed on the north façade facing Lake Worth, and a retail component has been incorporated into the northwest corner of the hotel annex structure. Staff recommends further refinement of the entrance to capture the richness of the Art Deco style.**
- Windows should be added on either side of the entrance on Lake Avenue to afford light to the interior spaces.  
**Revision Response: Additional full-light French doors have been proposed to address this concern.**
- Proposed colonnade should provide active public use.  
**Revision Response: The entire first floor colonnade has been revised to provide public space. The incorporation of a retail component in the northwest corner of the annex will provide for an active public use in this space.**
- Hotel rooms under the colonnade could be provided with balconettes as seen on the Lakeside Drive elevation.  
**Revision Response: Balconettes are not provided at this time, however they could be incorporated in the future without a negative impact on the Lake Avenue façade.**
- Due consideration should be provided for a retail component accessible from Lake Avenue.  
**Revision Response: A retail component has been added in the northwest corner of the hotel annex structure.**
- Art Deco inspired architecture is associated with exuberance, texture, color, verticality, and richness of materials. Capitalize on the full richness of the style.  
**Revision Response: The revision submittal does propose additional decorative detailing and a salmon color scheme, in keeping with the Art Deco style. This detailing could be further enhanced and expanded to capture the full richness and exuberance of the Art Deco style. Staff does have a concern over the repetitive use of the sunburst-type detail throughout the street facing façades. The detailing should be prioritized and a hierarchy assigned depending on location and prominence on the building. Additional motifs and designs can be utilized, and Staff can work with the Applicant moving forward.**

- Colonnade or arcade should read as a set of piers or columns with squared off openings.  
**Revision Response: The colonnade has been revised to include square openings with decorative trim. Each group of four openings should be symmetrical around a central axis, and the end piers should have equal or greater width than the interior piers. The current configuration leaves the piers closest to the Lake Avenue entrance with too little width.**

### **Three-story Parking Garage with Rooftop Parking**

- Regularize the façade for it to be more symmetrical. Entirety of first floor should be enclosed.  
**Revision Response: The west elevation of the parking garage has an asymmetrical configuration of 5 bays and 4 bays around a central axis. Staff is unsure as to the reason for this configuration. The openings could be adjusted in order to create a symmetrical façade. Alternately, the façade could be adjusted to reflect an axis with the properties across South Lakeside Drive.**
- Openings of garage should be infilled with Art Deco inspired decorative metal screens or masonry units. Should openings emulate windows, the configuration of the mullions should represent a Chicago-style window with a 1-2-1 or 1-3-1 ratio.  
**Revision Response: The revision drawings do not fully address this concern. No decorative screening or masonry units have been proposed, which could increase the design and detail of the fairly understated parking garage, as well as provide a visual barrier between the parked cars and pedestrian traffic on South Lakeside Drive and 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue South. Additionally, the frames proposed in the openings do not reflect the configuration of a true “Chicago window” as the proportion used is not accurate. These openings can be further refined to provide a more pleasant street experience and to enhance the aesthetics of the parking garage structure.**
- The stairwell of the garage could be shifted to the south so that the ingress/egress of the garage is all provided from the alley, which is in keeping with the Major Thoroughfare Guidelines.  
**Revision Response: The first floor parking is proposed to exit on 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue South, however levels two and three will exit through the alley.**
- As suggested in the Site Plan analysis, an additional floor to the parking garage would be appropriate with lower floor-to-floor heights to ensure the building does not exceed 35 feet in height. At this height, additional consideration should be afforded to provide transition to the residential to the south.  
**Revision Response: The Applicant has revised the parking garage design to incorporate a third floor and the overall garage height is 33'-8" to the top of the parapet wall. No transitional residential has been added to the south elevation at this time.**

### **COMPREHENSIVE PLAN CONSISTENCY:**

Staff has reviewed the applicable sections of the City’s Comprehensive Plan goals and objectives that would apply to this project. They are as follows:

**Goal 1.3** To preserve and enhance the City’s community character as a quality residential and business center within the Palm Beach County urban area. (Objective 1.3.4)

**Goal 1.6** To discourage urban sprawl. (Objective 1.6.1)

**Goal 1.4** Encourage preservation and rehabilitation of historic and natural resources and where appropriate restrict development that would damage or destroy these resources. (Objective 1.4.2)

**Policy 3.2.5.1:** Properties of special value for historic, architectural, cultural or aesthetic reasons will be restored and preserved through the enforcement of the City’s Historic Preservation Ordinance to the extent feasible.

**CONSEQUENT ACTION:**

Approve the application; approve the application with conditions; continue the hearing to a date certain to request additional information; or deny the application.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the Board discuss the analysis and issues outlined in this report and the revision drawings submitted. Should the Board choose to approve the request, Staff recommends the following conditions of approval:

- 1) All decorative detailing including mouldings, trim, spandrel panels, transoms, bas relief, medallions, railings, balcony brackets, and other decorative elements on the hotel annex and the parking garage structures shall be further refined to reflect the richness and exuberance of the Art Deco architectural style. The design and detailing shall reflect of hierarchy and differentiation of spaces, and the existing “sunburst” designs shall be adjusted accordingly. Additional decorative elements including applied brick, cast stone, mosaic tiles, or polychrome elements could be added to the structure. All decorative detailing shall be subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 2) The detailing of the entrance on Lake Avenue could be further defined and enhanced in order to further define this as a primary building entrance. Specific details for this entrance have not yet been provided, and shall be subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 3) The colonnade facing Lake Avenue shall be revised so that each group of four openings shall be symmetrical around a central axis, and the end piers shall have equal or greater width than the interior piers, subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 4) The size and specific location of the proposed 1/1 windows and French doors may be adjusted as needed to meet building code requirements. French doors shall not be installed in an inoperable or fixed condition, instead the design shall be adjusted as needed to incorporate windows or add balconies. All window and door alterations shall be subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 5) The windows and doors shall not have reflective mirrored glass.
- 6) The parking garage structure openings shall be further refined to incorporate decorative screening, masonry units, or other decorative feature in order to provide a visual barrier between the parked cars and pedestrian traffic on South Lakeside Drive and 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue South, subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.
- 7) The asymmetrical design of the parking garage west elevation may be adjusted as needed to resolve the enhanced decorative openings or create an axis with the properties across South Lakeside Drive, subject to Staff review and approval prior to permitting.

- 8) Per the City’s LDRs and the Major Thoroughfare Design Guidelines the façade of the upper floors of the hotel annex structure, above 30 feet in height, shall be set back between 8 and 12 additional feet from the front building façade.

**POTENTIAL MOTION:**

I MOVE TO APPROVE/DENY HRPB PR# 15-00100215: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for new construction of an annex hotel structure and parking garage associated with the historic Gulfstream Hotel, with conditions as recommended by Staff.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

1. See Justification Statement for Decision Criteria – New Construction
2. Revision Submittal Drawings dated 2/26/2016

**Location Map**

